From Concepts to Indicators: Examining Culture Through a Social Inclusion Lens

Presentation by M. Sharon Jeannotte

Plenary Session

National Economic and Social Forum

Dublin, Ireland

November 1, 2006
Outline of the presentation

- What is the value of culture?
- How does culture contribute to social inclusion and social cohesion?
- How do the concepts relate?
- What indicators are needed to measure the social effects of culture?
- How can these indicators be developed?
Value of culture

- Intrinsic value - subjective experience of culture
- Instrumental value - social or economic effects of culture
- Institutional value – the value for the public of “public goods” created by cultural institutions
A unified model of culture

- “Culture H” – traditions, the repository of past meanings and symbols
- “Culture C” – the making of new meanings and symbols through discovery and creative effort
- “Culture S” – the set of symbolic tools from which individuals construct their “ways of living”
Cultural capital - translating “Cultures C and H” into “Culture S”

- The “disposal of taste” or “consumption of specific cultural forms that mark people as members of specific classes” (Bourdieu)

- Three types:
  - Habitus – “Culture S”
  - Means of cultural expression – “Culture C”
  - Institutionalized – “Culture H”
How does cultural capital contribute value?

- Four possible linkages:
  - personal empowerment
  - cultural participation
  - cultural development and quality of life
  - cultural sustainability
## Cultural Attendance and Volunteer Rates (%): Canada 1998

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Volunteer Rate Attenders</th>
<th>Volunteer Rate Non-attenders</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attended children’s performance</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attended choral music performance</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attended dance performance</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attended classical music performance</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attended theatre performance</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attended opera</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visited commercial art gallery</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visited science museum</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Cultural Participation and Volunteer Rates (%) – Canada 1998

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Volunteer Rate Participants</th>
<th>Volunteer Rate Nonparticipants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acted or did other theatre activity</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sang in a choir or solo</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrote poetry, stories, non-fiction</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did choreography</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did artistic photography</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Played a musical instrument</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did visual arts</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did crafts</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rate of Voluntarism (%) by Volume of Cultural Participation
Canada 1998

Voluntarism Rate (%)

Volume of Cultural Participation (Number of Events)
Formal and substantive dimensions of social cohesion

**Formal**
- Equality/Inequality
- Recognition/Rejection
- Legitimacy/Illegitimacy

**Substantive**
- Inclusion/Exclusion
- Belonging/Isolation
- Participation/Non-involvement
What indicators are needed?

- Personal empowerment
- Cultural participation
- Cultural development and quality of life
- Cultural sustainability

- Indicators of belonging and inclusion
- Indicators of participation and motivation
- Indicators of linkages to economic and social capital (e.g. trust, reciprocity, social connections, altruistic behaviour)
Inclusion and participation – Some areas to address

- Are the conditions in place to ensure access to culture for everyone?
- What is the situation of vulnerable populations with regard to cultural practices?
- What impact does culture have on social integration and the exercise of citizenship?
- To what extent are citizens able to participate in the implementation of cultural policies?
- What are citizens’ cultural expectations and their level of satisfaction?
Stages of indicator development

- Conceptualisation
- Selection
- Definition
- Collection
- Ongoing management and evaluation
Data and indicator pitfalls

- Culture -- a "soft" area, while data and indicators are usually "hard" measures.
- Insufficient time taken to frame the questions that researchers/policy-makers want to answer.
- Frameworks are unwieldy ↔ policy objectives are vague.
- Usability essential but may narrow scope of interest or privilege particular perspectives.
Methodological critiques of studies on the social effects of culture

- Anecdotal not quantitative
- Small samples
- No control groups
- No longitudinal dimension
- No evidence of causal links between cultural participation and positive social outcomes
Responses to methodological critiques

- National survey with large sample size
- Include sport participation, cultural participation, motivation, social capital and social inclusion questions, as well as all standard socio-economic and demographic variables
- Repeat survey at five-year intervals
- Make public use files available to academic community for analysis
Diagram 1: Proposed Survey of Leisure Activity and Motivation (SLAM) Framework

Leisure activities (culture and sports)

Motivation

Socio-demographic factors: age, sex, education, income, etc.

Citizens

Social cohesion

Social capital

Social outcomes of consumption

Health & well-being

Human capital

Non-participants

Social Engagement & sense of personal well-being

Attitudes towards culture & sports
Cultural Inclusion - data and indicator payoffs

- Identification of the social dynamics that contribute to exclusion or promote inclusion
- Identification of activities and interventions that promote cultural capital formation
- Identification of the linkages between individual and collective benefits of cultural participation
- Sounder evidence of the value of culture